## **CHAPTER ONE**

## **INTRODUCTION**

#### 1.0 Preamble

The laws establishing Federal Universities and Inter-University Centres in Nigeria require that the President, as the Visitor should, from time to time set up Visitation Panels to take stock of the activities of the institutions for the purpose of determining the extent to which they have fulfilled their mandates. Consequently, the President, Commander-in-Chief of the Armed Forces of the Federal Republic of Nigeria, Muhammadu Buhari, approved the constitution of Visitation Panels to 38 Federal Universities and 4 Inter-University Centres.

## 1.1 Inauguration of the Panels

The Honourable Minister of Education, Mallam Adamu Adamu, on behalf of the President, inaugurated the 42 Visitation Panels on Tuesday, 13<sup>th</sup> April 2021 at the Idris Abdulkadir Auditorium of the National Universities Commission, among which was the Panel to the Federal University, Dutsin-Ma.

## 1.2 Composition of the Panel

The Visitation Panel to the Federal University, Dutsin-Ma brought together distinguished Nigerians, to bring their various experiences to bear on the process of ensuring credible reports on the University for a period covering 2011 to 2015 and 2016 to 2020. Members of the Panel are:

i) Professor Onje Gye-Wado - Chairman
 ii) Professor Edward Olorunsola Olanipekun - Member
 iii) Professor Amina Abubakar Bashir - Member

iii) Professor Affilia Abubakai basiiii - Meffiber

iv) Professor Balarabe Alhaji Haruna - Member

v) Barr. Uche Nnawulezi, Ph.D - Member

vi) Engr. Muhammad Rabiu Abubakar - Member

vii) Mrs. Lydia Tani Imoroa - Secretary

## 1.3 Terms of Reference

The Panel had a 10-point Terms of Reference as follows:

- To inquire into the level of implementation of the White Paper on the last Visitation report;
- ii) To examine the leadership quality of the University in terms of roles of Governing Council with Vice Chancellor, other Principal Officers as well as organs of the Institution;
- iii) To look into the financial management of the Institution including statutory allocations and internally-generated revenue over the recommended period and determine whether it was in compliance with appropriate regulations;
- iv) To investigate the application of funds, particularly the special grants and loans meant for specific projects, in order to determine the status of such projects and their relevance for further funding;
- v) To examine adequacy of the staff and staff development programs of the University;
- vi) To determine the relationship between the University and the various statutory bodies it interacts with according to its law, for the purposes of supervision, planning, finance, discipline, guidance and any other relationship (i.e. Governing Council, National Universities Commission, Federal Ministry of Education);
- vii) To examine the law establishing the University, including the relationship between the various internal organs, units and offices and indicate the

- ways the law has been observed by the competent authorities and also suggest any modifications to the law;
- viii) To trace the historical evolution of the University and take stock of its net achievements and problems as well as its style and direction.
- ix) To examine the general security in the University and how the University has dealt with it and recommend appropriate measures; and
- x) To examine the processes and structures of discipline of students in the University in line with due process of the rule of law.

## **CHAPTER TWO**

#### **METHODOLOGY**

## 2.0 Arrival of the Panel at Federal University, Dutsin-Ma

The Panel arrived Federal University, Dutsin-Ma on Wednesday, 21<sup>st</sup> April, 2021, held its first meeting the same day and mapped out the modalities for carrying out the assignment. It planned to apply wide-ranging and comprehensive methodologies for data gathering including: call for memoranda from the University community and the general public, extensive interactions and interviews with relevant stakeholders, collection of briefings from key officers of the University, and consultations with staff and students.

## 2.1 Courtesy Calls

The Panel subsequently paid courtesy calls on the Governor of Katsina State, the Emir of Katsina, the Commissioner of Police and the Director, State Security Services. In each case, the Chairman of the Panel took time to explain the purpose of the visitation which was to assess the Federal University, Dutsin-Ma, as it relates to the development of the University, its relationship with the community and the aspirations of Nigerians in respect of the institution. It was also to seek their support in carrying out the assignment. The Chairman further assured them that the Panel was not intended to witch-hunt or punish anyone, but only to collect and collate the relevant facts and present them to the Visitor, the President, Commander-in-Chief of the Armed Forces of the Federal Republic of Nigeria. He promised them that the Panel would carry out its job diligently, fairly and without malice.

## 2.2 Inspection of Facilities/Projects

The Panel embarked on a tour of the University to inspect physical facilities available for teaching, learning and research, as well as the inspection of completed and on-going projects in the University's campuses. This afforded the

Panel the opportunity for on-the-spot assessments of the developments, achievements and problems of the University during the period under review. The tour of the University took the Panel through the Council and Senate Chambers, University Library, Faculties, University Clinic, Male and Female Hostels, ICT Centre, Laboratories, Sports Complex, Classrooms/Lecture Theatres.

## 2.3 Call for Memoranda and Documents

The Panel requested for memoranda from the University community and general public through print and electronic media. It also requested for 8 copies of each submitted memorandum for distribution to all Panel members. A total of fifteen (15) memoranda were received in hard and soft copies from individuals and groups. Other official documents related to the various operations of the University were also obtained from the University, such as Minutes of Council, Senate and Congregation, the University Law, Academic Brief, Student Handbooks, Staff Nominal Roll (Academic and Non-Academic), Conditions of Service of Staff, etc. The Panel also requested for briefing documents from the Vice Chancellor and other Principal Officers, Director of Physical Planning and Works, Director of Academic Planning, Director of Legal Affairs, Director of ICT, departments and special units.

## 2.4 Interviews/Interactions

The Panel conducted interactive sessions with the Council, Congregation, Principal Officers, Directors, Deans of Faculties, Unions, students, as well as with some authors of the memoranda. A town hall meeting was also held with members of the University community, host community and other relevant stakeholders. The Panel also interacted with the pioneer Vice Chancellor, Prof. James Ayatse. Special interactive sessions were also held separately with former Vice Chancellors (one substantive and two acting) namely: Prof. Haruna Abdu Kaita, Prof. Adamu N. Baba-Kutigi and Dr. Babangida U. Dangani.

## 2.5 CONCLUSION

The Chairman urged members to live up to the high expectations of the Visitor in the discharge of their duties and to treat all matters relating to the assignment with utmost responsibility. It was emphasized that the exercise was neither a witch-hunting nor malicious one. It was aimed at improving the Nigerian University System and the further development of our country.

# CHAPTER THREE TERM OF REFERENCE NO. 1

To inquire into the level of implementation of the White Paper on the last Visitation report

Established in 2011, the Federal University, Dutsin-Ma had not been subjected to any visitation exercise in the past, hence NO WHITE PAPER to implement.

## **CHAPTER FOUR**

## **TERM OF REFERENCE NO. 2**

To examine the leadership quality of the University in terms of roles of Governing

Council with Vice Chancellor, other Principal Officers as well as organs of the

Institution.

## 4.0 INTRODUCTION

In addressing this ToR, the Panel focused on the quality of leadership that Council, Senate, the Vice Chancellor and other Principal Officers have provided in the course of carrying out their statutory functions at Federal University, Dutsin-Ma between 2016 to 2020.

The Panel relied on oral interviews, briefs submitted by some of the officers concerned and Minutes of Meetings, in assessing the quality of leadership.

#### 4.1 OBSERVATIONS

- i) The Council is the governing body of the University, charged with the general control and superintendence of the policies, finances and property of the University, including its public relations.
- ii) The Senate is the supreme authority on all academic matters and it has the Vice-Chancellor as its ex-officio Chairman. It is the responsibility of Senate to, among others, organize and control teaching in the University, admission into various academic programmes, discipline of students, and promote research.
- iii) The following persons presided over the administration of the University between January 2016 and December 2020 (and to date, June 2021): Prof. James Ayatse, Vice-Chancellor (February 2011 February 2016); Prof. Haruna A. Kaita, Vice-Chancellor (February 2016 April 2017); Prof. Armaya'u Hamisu Bichi, acting Vice-Chancellor (April 2017 March 2019); Prof. Adamu N. Baba-Kutigi, acting Vice-Chancellor (March September 2019); Dr. Babangida U. Dangani, acting

- Vice-Chancellor (September 2019 May 2020); and Prof. Armaya'u Hamisu Bichi, Vice-Chancellor (May 2020 to date).
- iv) Aliyu Dalha Kankia, was appointed by Council as Registrar for a five (5)-year tenure with effect from 1<sup>st</sup> June, 2016. His tenure was preceded by a short stint of the appointment of Mrs. Wasila Sani Saulawa, who served as acting Registrar for less than four (4) months (February 15 to May 31, 2016).
- v) Abdullahi Abass served as acting Bursar between 2016 and 2017. The incumbent Bursar, Mohammed Bah Lawan was appointed in 2017. He appears to be knowledgeable in financial management and accounting procedures. The Panel was however not impressed that the bursary operations were yet to be computerized.
- vi) Dr. Babangida U. Dangani was appointed substantive University Librarian in May 2015 and his tenure ended on 4<sup>th</sup> May, 2020 but was granted a one year extension by the Council. Kabir M. Ibrahim held the fort as acting University Librarian between September 2019 and May 2020 when Dr. Babangida U. Dangani served as the acting Vice Chancellor of the University.

## 4.2 COUNCIL

## 4.2.1 Findings

- i) The tenure of the first Council chaired by H.E. Erelu (Dr.) Olusola Obada, came to an end in January 2016.
- ii) Dr. Marliyya Zayyan assumed leadership as the Pro-Chancellor and Chairman of the second Council in February 2016. The Zayyan-led Council consolidated on the foundation laid by the Obada-led Council by putting in place some policies and committees that were necessary for the smooth running of the University.
- iii) The decision of the Zayyan-led Council taken at its 9<sup>th</sup> Meeting held between 7<sup>th</sup> and 9<sup>th</sup> September, 2017 to approve the decision of Senate, contrary to the Universities (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1993 as amended, to re-appoint Prof. Armaya'u Hamisu Bichi as acting Vice-Chancellor for more than six (6) months was contrary to the provisions of the law.

iv) The 3<sup>rd</sup> Council held its inaugural (18<sup>th</sup>) meeting on 21<sup>st</sup> August, 2020 under the leadership of Alhaji Uba Ahmed Nana as the Pro-Chancellor and Chairman of Council.

#### 4.2.2 Recommendations

- Council should revisit all cases of irregular appointments, conversions, redesignations, promotions made since the inception of the University in 2011 and dispassionately do the needful without fear, favour or contradiction.
- ii) Council should be reprimanded for failing in its responsibility to adhere to the Universities (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1993 as amended, by approving the erroneous recommendation made by Senate in respect of the appointment of Prof. Armaya'u Hamisu Bichi as acting Vice-Chancellor for another term of six (6) months.
- iii) Representative of the Federal Ministry of Education in Council should be more vigilant and promptly report any infraction or non-adherence to extant law, regulations, statutes, circulars, etc., to the appropriate quarters (NUC, FME) for necessary action.
- iv) The Visitor, through the FME and NUC should ensure that all appointments including the Vice-Chancellor and other Principal Officers are henceforth made in strict compliance with extant law and regulations.
- v) The Visitor should reconstitute Councils as soon as dissolved. A situation whereby Council is dissolved to pave way for the appointment of the Vice-Chancellor or any of the Principal Officers, in violation of the Universities (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1993 as amended, should be discouraged to avoid precipitating unwarranted crisis in our universities.

#### 4.3 SENATE

## 4.3.1 Findings

 Senate contravened the Universities (Miscellaneous Provisions) Act 1993 as amended by recommending Prof. Armaya'u Hamisu Bichi for appointment as acting Vice-Chancellor for another term of six (6) months.

- ii) Senate also approved that holders of HND from recognized Polytechnics should be members of the Congregation, contrary to Section 11 of the Federal University of Dutsin-Ma (Establishment) Act, 2015 and The Third Schedule.
- iii) It is an aberration in the university system that Senate could not find any suitable Professor to be appointed as acting Vice-Chancellor and decided to recommend the University Librarian, Dr. Babangida U. Dangani, for that highly exalted position. It is an aberration in the university system for someone who is not a Professor to superintend over the second level promotion of academic staff (Readers and Professors).
- iv) It is worthy of note that Senate met and considered examination results as and when due, and this singular action made it possible for the University to graduate its first set of students in 2015.

#### 4.3.2 Recommendations

- Senate should be reprimanded for not living up to expectation in its decisions and should be advised to conduct its proceedings dispassionately according to laws, statutes and regulations.
- ii) Members of the Congregation should be as specified in the Federal University of Dutsin-Ma (Establishment) Act 2015.
- iii) Senate should be advised to conduct its proceedings dispassionately devoid of bias, rancour, favouritism, and in line with extant law, rules, regulations and statutes.

#### 4.4 VICE-CHANCELLOR

## 4.4.1 Findings

i) The following persons presided over the administration of the University between January 2016 and December 2020 (and to date, June 2021): Prof. James Ayatse, Vice-Chancellor (February 2011 – February 2016); Prof. Haruna A. Kaita, Vice-Chancellor (February 2016 – April 2017); Prof. Armaya'u Hamisu Bichi, acting Vice-Chancellor (April 2017 – March 2019); Prof. Adamu N. Baba-Kutiqi, acting Vice-Chancellor (March – September 2019); Dr. Babanqida U.

- Dangani, acting Vice-Chancellor (September 2019 May 2020); and Prof. Armaya'u Bichi, Vice-Chancellor (May 2020 to date).
- ii) The present Vice-Chancellor, Prof. Armaya'u Hamisu Bichi, assumed duty on May 20, 2020. He is being assisted by the Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Academic), Prof. Lawal A. Saulawa and the Deputy Vice-Chancellor (Administration), Dr. Mary Agbo. There seemed to be a good rapport and working relationship between the Vice-Chancellor and other Principal Officers. Having been in and out of office, the Vice-Chancellor has demonstrated an appreciable understanding of the challenges confronting the University.
- iii) From the records presented above, it is evident that the University has been administered by five (5) different persons within a period of five (5) years and this is a pointer to the instability in the management structure of the University. This instability is not unconnected with the absence of a Council at some time coupled with failure of the Council and the Visitor (through the FME and NUC) to take firm and decisive actions as and when appropriate.

#### 4.4.2 Recommendations

- i) The University must ensure that the principles of due process and fair hearing are strictly complied with in all matters.
- ii) The University should explore the possibility of out-of-court settlement so as to reduce wastage of time and financial resources of the University.
- iii) The practice of appointing a non-Professor (when there are competent Professors in the services of the University) either as acting Vice Chancellor or Deputy Vice Chancellor should be discouraged.

#### 4.5 REGISTRAR

## 4.5.1 Findings

i) Aliyu Dalha Kankia as the Registrar seemed to have a good understanding of operations of the Registry. The Registry is structured into five departments/divisions: Office of the Registrar, Establishment Division, Academic Affairs Division, Council Affairs Division, and Legal and Industrial Relations. ii) However, the Panel discovered that almost all the minutes of Council meetings were not signed by the Chairman and Secretary.

#### 4.5.2 Recommendations

The Registrar, being the Secretary of statutory committees must ensure that all minutes of meetings are signed.

## 4.6 BURSAR

## 4.6.1 Findings

The Panel was not impressed that the bursary operations were yet to be computerized.

## 4.6.2 Recommendations

- All allocations and internally generated revenue should be paid into central University account(s) and disbursed according to procedure(s) approved by Council.
- ii) Accounting manuals and financial regulations should be reviewed periodically in line with relevant laws and regulations.

#### 4.7 UNIVERSITY LIBRARIAN

#### 4.7.1 Findings

- i) The Library is blessed with competent staff, who have spent some time working in the Library. It has library facilities at both the Take-off campus and the Main campus, located about 20 km apart.
- ii) The Panel observed that the Library is yet to digitalise its collections particularly the old books, manuscripts, journals. However, the Panel noted that the library has 50 units of computers for virtual library, apart from subscribing to Online Databases like HINARI, AGORA, OARE, ARDI and AJOL.

#### 4.7.2 Recommendations

i) The Panel recommends that the operations of the Library should be computerized while digitalization of the collections should be carried out as soon as practicable.

ii)	Council should University Libra service delivery	arian who will l		
		,		

## **CHAPTER FIVE**

#### **TERM OF REFERENCE NO. 3**

To look into the financial management of the Institution including statutory allocations and internally-generated revenue over the recommended period and determine whether it was in compliance with appropriate regulations

## 5.0 INTRODUCTION

The Panel approached this Term of Reference by examining all the relevant Financial records and Regulations made available. It looked at the Sources and utilization of funds in capital, recurrent, TETFund and special allocations and the internal revenue of the University. The External Auditors Reports in the period under review were closely reviewed.

#### 5.1 OBSERVATIONS

- i) The following documents are crucial for an effective financial management of the University:
  - a. Federal Universities of Dutsin-Ma (Establishment) Act, 2015.
  - b. Public Procurement Act, 2007
  - c. Finance Act, 2020
  - d. Fiscal Responsibility Act, 2007
  - e. Civil service rules (for recruitment and other financial matters)
  - f. Accounting manuals of the University
  - g. Federal Government Financial instructions
  - h. Previous years' External Auditor's and Internal Auditor's financial statements and Management reports
- ii) Stakeholders in the University are involved in the budgetary process and information on financial approvals of Government fund releases were made available to relevant Departments and Units.

- iii) There was inadequate and untimely release of Capital and overhead grants noticed throughout the period under review.
- iv) During the period under review, there was noticeable increase in Government grant.
- v) No External Auditors Reports were submitted from the year 2016 to 2020; financial statements and the corresponding Management letters were not submitted to the University for the approval of Council. The reason might not be un-connected with instability in the leadership of the institution. This is contrary to section 7(4) of the University (Establishment) law, which prescribes that the accounts of the University should be audited annually.
- vi) The Panel observed that the substantial part the grant received by the University within the period came from TETFund.
- vii) The main source of IGR of the University is the Students registration fees. Other sources were Consultancy fees from Departments and Faculties, money generated from Postgraduate Sandwich Courses.
- viii) Monitoring visits by various government agencies had greatly assisted the University in observing regulations, accountability and expenditure control.

## 5.2 BUDGETARY PROCESS AND MANAGEMENT

## 5.2.1 Findings

Financial management of resources were in compliance with some standing guidelines and regulations.

## 5.2.2 Recommendations

The University should constitute a budget monitoring committee to ensure effective implementation of the approved budget.

#### 5.3 STATUTORY ALLOCATION

Table 5.0 shows amount appropriated, amount released, amount utilized and the percentage level of performance for the period under review.

**Table 5.0: Budget Performance for 2016 – 2020** 

YEAR	TYPE OF GRANT	AMOUNT APPROPRIATED N	AMOUNT RELEASED	AMOUNT UTILIZED	LEVEL OF PERFORMANCE %	REMARK
2016	Personnel	1,861,908,046	1,567,608,748.42	1,564,451,233.32	84	
	Overhead	82,588,929	61,099,941.41	61,099,053.50	74	
	Capital	454,794,343	260,876,606.10	255,384,387.35	56	
	Total	2,399,291,318	1,889,585,295.93	1,880,934,674.17	78	
2017	Personnel	1,991,345,504	1,681,027,496.35	1,680,982,952.19	84	
	Overhead	104,980,672	52,468,310.75	51,828,786.70	49	
	Capital	400,300,663	279,849,967.10	164,570,387.35	41	
	Total	2,496,626,839	1,898,066,194,45	1,897,382126.24	76	
2018	Personnel	2,384,144,580	2,221,299,198.33	2,219,514,702.46	93	
	Overhead	102,754,672	59,190,225.31	58,916,458.73	57	
	Capital	1,100,300,663	460,000,000.00	-	0	
	Total	3,587,199,915	2,740,489,423.64	2,278,431,161.19	65	
2019	Personnel	2,672,002,266	1,948,438,406.00	1,938,311,372.97	73	
	Overhead	102,754,672	51,377,336.00	39,704,609.94	39	
	Capital	322,361,266	90,305,601,07	55,403,679.16	17	
	Total	3,097,118,204	2,090,121,343.07	2,033,419,662.07	66	
2020	Personnel	3,568,896,854	297,408,071.17	294,269,811.12	8	
	Overhead	102,754,672	50,669,081.65	50,652,468.34	72	
	Capital	211,261,266	127,826,625.74	125,153,319.20	59	
	Total	3,882,912,792	475,903,778.56	470,075,598.66	12	

## 5.3.1 Findings

- i) The Overhead grant releases range between N3m to N5m per month, which is not enough to cover even the cost of diesel consumed monthly by the University.
- ii) The Capital grants received for the period were low, erratic and untimely. For instance, in the year 2017, the University's approved Capital grant was N400,300,663 and appropriation inflows were:
  - N128,676,933.00 on 21/01/2017
  - N132,199,673.10 on 16/03/2017
  - N18,973,361.00 on 25/08/2017

Summing up to N279,849,967.10 and the budget performance level as can be seen in Table 5.0 is just 41%. Though the amount was low, there was significant increase compared to what was obtained in the previous years.

iii) There was non-utilisation of Capital Appropriation Inflow in the year 2018, thus the level of performance was 0%.

#### 5.3.2 Recommendations

- i) The paltry allocation for Overheads to the University should be revisited.
- ii) The University should avoid non-utilisation of Capital Appropriate Inflow.
- iii) The University should, in implementing their annual budgets ensure that the principles and practice of matching expenditure against income are strictly applied.
- iv) The University should ensure that budgets are not exceeded when awarding contracts for projects.

## 5.4 QUARTERLY AND ANNUAL INTERNAL AUDITING

## 5.4.1 Findings

- i) The University has a Directorate of Internal Audit.
- ii) There have been quarterly and yearly Internal Audit reports.
- iii) The Directorate has made several observations on some irregularities which Management had failed to correct, including some payments without Audit certification.

#### 5.4.2 Recommendations

- The Management should address all observations made by the Directorate of Internal Audit.
- ii) Management should not make any payment until there is certification by the Director of Internal Audit.
- iii) Council should be directed to further investigate any irregularities as identified by the Internal Auditor.

## 5.5 EXTERNAL AUDITING OF THE UNIVERSITY FINANCES

## 5.5.1 Findings

There have been no External Auditor's reports for the period under review.

#### 5.5.2 Recommendations

- i) Council should direct External Auditors to submit their reports along with the University accounts at the end of each financial year.
- ii) The Council should direct the External Auditors to present the five years financial statements and the Management Letters for approval.

#### 5.6. SOURCES OF FUNDING

## 5.6.1 Findings

- i) Major sources of funds for the University were from Government through the Federal Ministry of Finance (Capital and Recurrent), the Tertiary Education Trust Fund (TETFund), the NEEDS Assessment and Donor Agencies/Philanthropies. Another important source of funding in the University was the Internally Generated Revenue (IGR) to supplement government grants.
- ii) Capital grants were used for capital projects development and maintenance of physical infrastructures and utilities.
- iii) Recurrent grants received were mainly used for payments of Staff Salaries, Wages and Overhead Costs.
- iv) Special grants were meant to supplement capital releases.
- v) The TETFund intervention grants were used to intervene in funding of capital projects for the improvement of teaching and learning facilities, Library development, Research and for staff development.
- vi) The Internally generated Revenue was used for some Capital Projects as well as for recurrent expenditures.
- vii) The Panel observed that the TETFund Grant was second to the total of Recurrent Subvention received within the period under consideration. TETFund Grant was about 37% of the total funds received including Internally Generated Revenue; while the Recurrent Grant was about 46% of the Total Grant Received.

- viii) The Internally Generated Revenue contribution to the Total Revenue was about 9.8% and the Capital Grant contribution was 7%.
- ix) An increase in Capital Grant was observed over the period compared with what was obtained in the previous years between 2011-2015.
- x) Internally Generated Revenue also jumped from N351,601,222 in 2011-2015 to about N1,690,281,215.77 in the period under review.
- xi) It was observed that there were no grants from Needs Assessment and Donor Agencies/Individuals as can be seen in Table 5.1.

Table 5.1: Grants received from Government and the revenue generated (2016-2020)

S/N	Type of Grant	Amount (	N)				
		2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	Total
1.	Recurrent Allocations	1,628,708,689	1,733,495,80	2,280,489,423.6	1,999,815,74	348,077,15	7,990,586,815.39
		.83	7.10	4	2.00	2.82	
2.	Capital Allocations	260,876,606.1	279,849,967.	460,000,000.00	90,305,601.0	127,826,62	1,218,858,800.01
۷.	'	0	10		7	5.74	
3.	TETFUND	1,331,410,000	1,075,600,00	330,647,400	1,281,084,39	2,385,000,0	6,403,741,792.00
٥.			0		2	00	
4.	Needs Assessment	-	-	-	-	-	-
5.	Donor Agencies	-	-	-	-	-	-
6.	Internally generated	142,177,768.0	248,496,847.	249,298,702.08	663,894,103.	386,413,79	1,690,281,215.77
٥.	, 5	5	60		13	4.91	
	TOTAL	3,363,173,063	3,337,442,62	3,320,435,525.7	4,035,099,83	3,247,317,5	17,303,468,623.1
		.98	1.80	2	8.20	73.47	6

#### **5.6.2 Recommendations**

i) Government should consider increasing the capital grant and ensure timely release of funds to match increasing demand in Physical Infrastructures in the University. This will go a long way in reducing problems faced in accessing/utilizing the funds as well as ensuring timely completion of projects that will reduce the problem of Capital projects abandonments.

- ii) Needs Assessment Projects Intervention is also vital to the growth of the University Physical Infrastructures. Hence, Government should continue to release the funds to the University in compliance with 2009 ASUU-FGN Agreement.
- iii) Government should ensure full compliance with specific suggested amendments to the Education Trust Fund (ETF) amendment Act of 2003.
- iv) The University management should be more alive to its responsibilities to ensure that all funds allocated to the University are accessed promptly.
- v) The University should endeavour to improve the participation of the private sector, Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) voluntary agencies and individual philanthropists in contributing to the funding of the Institution.

#### 5.7. DEVELOPMENTS AND MANAGEMENT OF PHYSICAL FACILITIES

The University received grants from Federal Government allocations through the Federal Ministry of Finance and TETFund for the development and management of physical facilities as shown in Table 5.1 above.

The projects undertaken by the University within the period under review are classified as:

- TETFund Intervention Projects (Normal, Special, Zonal, High Impact, Library, Research and Development and Entrepreneurship).
- ii) Capital Projects
- iii) Internally Generated Revenue Projects.

The overview of projects executed within the period under review is as indicated in **Appendix B1** in Volume II of this Report.

## 5.7.1 Findings

 There were 42 capital projects funded through TETFund (Take-off grant) ranging from Construction and Remodelling/Rehabilitation works, procurement of equipment and supply of furniture, provision of Books and Library Journals. The total amount expended was N6,403,741,792.00 and all the projects were completed and commissioned with exception of two, which are on-going (Construction of Students Hostel at the Main campus and Procurement of Furniture for Vice Chancellor's Office). All the Projects have bearing on teaching and learning, students and staff welfare.

ii) Capital Projects amounting to N1,218,858,800.01 mainly executed at the Main Campus of the University. These were new construction works, rehabilitation works, procurement of equipment and furniture. Majority of these projects have been completed while few are on-going. For more details refer to **Appendix B3** in Volume II of this Report.

## 5.7.2 Recommendations

- i) The University should make provision in its annual budget proposals for regular maintenance of Physical Facilities.
- ii) The University should always be prepared for quick and immediate utilisation of capital grants as soon as released.

## 5.8. INTERNALLY GENERATED REVENUE (IGR)

## 5.8.1 Findings

- i) The Panel observed that the University's Internally Generated Revenue (IGR) is low, mostly generated from students' registration fees and other academic charges, Contractors registration and Tenders fees.
- ii) The IGR fund was generally used in supplementing the University Overhead expenses and Capital expenditures. For details of projects executing with IGR funds refer to **Appendix B3**.
- iii) During the period under review the Internally Generated Revenue (IGR) of the University was as indicated in Table 5.2:

Table 5.2: Record of IGR (2016-2020)

S/N	Year	Amount (N)		
1.	2016	142,177,768,05		
2.	2017	248,496,847.60		

3.	2018	249,298,702.08
4.	2019	663,894,103.13
5.	2020	386,413,794.91
TOTAL		1,690,281,215.77

#### 5.8.2 Recommendations

- i) There is need for the University to explore other sources of revenue to enhance its IGR base.
- ii) The University should intensify its revenue generation drive through the Guest-House, Micro Finance Bank, Bookshop Endowment funds and Alumni Associations. It should look both inward and outward for ways to improve on its internally generated revenue.
- iii) The Panel further recommends that the University should make rigorous efforts to capture all the incomes from the Internally Generated Revenue (IGR).
- iv) The University should put in place adequate mechanisms to ensure effective revenue drive by all the Internally Generated Revenue Centers.

## 5.9 ADHERENCE TO STANDARD NORMS IN FUND DISTRIBUTION AND UTILIZATION

## 5.9.1 Findings

- i) The Council is responsible for the general control and superintendence of the policy, finances and property of the University.
- ii) Accounts of the University were not properly audited in 2016 -2020.
- iii) Accounting Manual was not in place for proper guide of recording functions.

## 5.9.2 Recommendations

- Accounts of the University should be audited at the end of every financial year as prescribed by Law.
- ii) Accounting manual should be provided in the Bursary Department for proper guide in keeping records.
- iii) The Panel recommends that the University should maintain ledger for all projects and ensure that all entrances are made properly.

## 5.10 MONITORING OF PROJECTS BY RELEVANT AGENCIES

## **5.10.1 Findings**

Government agencies during the period under review (i.e. 2016 - 2020) paid scheduled and unscheduled visits to the University. Table 5.3 indicates these activities:

**Table 5.3: Projects Monitoring Activities (2016-2020)** 

S/N	Name of Agency	Monitoring Focus
1.	National Universities Commission (NUC)	<ul> <li>a) Vetting of submissions on Capital Projects</li> <li>b) The state of physical facilities</li> <li>c) Advising on fund resource allocations</li> <li>d) Verification of financial documents submitted to NUC.</li> <li>e) Capacity building of professional staff</li> </ul>
2.	Tertiary Education Trust Fund (TETFund)	Monitoring the resource allocation and the state of physical facilities undertaken.
3.	Office of Accountant General of the Federation	a) Financial records     b) Auditing
4.	Office of Auditor General of the Federation	<ul><li>a) Financial records</li><li>b) Auditing</li></ul>
5.	Budget Office of the Federation	Monitoring of budget implementation and challenges
6.	National Assembly	Oversight function to ensure that institutions operate in accordance with guided laws
7.	National Economic Intelligence Committee	Monitoring of budget implementation and ensuring judicious utilization of allocated funds
8.	NEEDS Assessment Implementation Committee	Monitoring and oversight function to ensure that funds allocated are judiciously used in accordance with guiding laws

## **5.10.2 Recommendations**

- Monitoring of the University's finances and projects by the various agencies of government should continue as this would complement the functions of the Council.
- ii) The NUC should be commended for living up to its supervisory role as evidenced from its monitoring exercises.
- iii) Council should strengthen its monitoring and evaluation mechanisms.

## **CHAPTER SIX**

#### **TERM OF REFERENCE NO. 4**

To investigate the application of funds, particularly the special grants and loans meant for specific projects, in order to determine the status of such projects and their relevance for further funding

## 6.0 INTRODUCTION

The Panel approached this Term of Reference by examining all the relevant Financial records and Regulations made available. It looked at the sources and utilization of funds in capital, recurrent, TETFund and special allocations and the internal revenue of the University. The External Auditor's Reports in the period under review were closely reviewed. The Panel also made references to the following documents:

- i. Federal Universities of Dutsin-Ma (Establishment) Act, 2015.
- ii. Public Procurement Act, 2007.
- iii. Finance Act, 2020.
- iv. Civil Service Rules (for recruitment and other financial matters)
- v. Accounting Manuals of the University.
- vi. Federal Government Financial instructions.
- vii. Previous years' External Auditor's and Internal Auditor's financial statements and Management reports.

## **6.1 OBSERVATIONS**

- i) The University received grants from TETFund and Needs Assessment Fund within the period under review.
- ii) No loans were assessed during the period 2016-2020.
- iii) In the same vein, it was also observed that the University did not maintain TETFund Assets Register.

- iv) The Projects had greatly helped in reducing the infrastructural deficit in the University and bearing on teaching and learning.
- v) The University maintains its Master Plan for the use in the planning of the academic and physical development of the University.

#### 6.2 GRANTS FOR SPECIFIC PROJECTS

## 6.2.1 Findings

- i) The University's total budgetary allocation for capital projects over the period was N2,489,018,201. However, only a total of N1,218,858,800.01 was consequently released. Though there was appreciable increase in budgetary allocations and disbursements compared to the previous years, there is need for improvement as the provisions are still inadequate for the University to have meaningful Infrastructural development.
- ii) Generally, budgetary provision to education as enunciated by UNESCO benchmark is still far below the agreed minimum of 26% of the Federal Government budget.
- iii) The University received grants from Federal Government, Tertiary Education Trust Fund (TETFund) and Needs Assessment Committee within the period under review (2016 2020). These are summarized under the three main categories and Table 6.0 gives the details:

Table 6.0: Grants received in the year (2016-2020)

S/	Type of	Amount (N)					
N	Grant	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	Total
1.	TETFUND	1,331,410,000	1,075,600,000	330,647,400	1,281,084,392	2,385,000,000	6,403,741,792
2.	Needs	-	-	-	-	-	
	Assessment						
	TOTAL	1,331,410,000	1,075,600,000	330,647,400	1,281,084,392	2,385,000,000	6,403,741,792

#### 6.2.2 Recommendations

- i) The Government should consider increasing the annual statutory capital grant to the University.
- ii) The Panel also recommends regular release of grants and in good time.

## 6.3 GRANTS FROM TETFUND

## 6.3.1 Findings

- i) The total Capital Grant received by the University within the period from TETFund was N6,403,741,792.00 which included Merged Library, Annual, Project Maintenance, Special, Zonal, Research and Development, High Impact Interventions within 2016-2020 period.
- ii) The University seemed to have no difficulty in accessing its funds for capital projects from TETFund, provided it fulfilled all the conditions required.
- iii) It was observed that all funds allocated to projects were used for those particular projects as approved by the sponsor.
- iv) Substantial numbers of the projects were completed and some are still on-going. For details of the projects refer to **Appendix B1** in Volume II of this Report.

#### 6.3.2 Recommendations

The University should employ more diligence in accessing and managing its funds to ensure more effective utilisation of funds from such source.

#### 6.4 NEEDS ASSESSMENT GRANT

## 6.4.1 Findings

No Grant was received from the Needs Assessment Fund between the year 2016-2020, as such no Projects executed within the period under review.

#### 6.4.2 Recommendations

- i) More Needs Assessment grants should be allocated to the University for development and maintenance of infrastructures in the Institution.
- ii) When carrying out Needs Assessment for any project, due diligence must be followed in order to get the best out of the exercise before approval is given.

## 6.5 MANAGEMENT AND DEVELOPMENT OF PHYSICAL FACILITIES AND HUMAN CAPITAL

## 6.5.1 Findings

- i) The University maintains Master Plan for use in the planning of the academic and physical development of the University.
- ii) From the records of the various monitoring agencies and the outcome of the inspection of some facilities by the Panel, it was noted that there was some level of prudence in management and use of available resources of the University.

#### 6.5.2 Recommendations

- i) The University should make provision in each year's budget for the maintenance of the physical Infrastructures.
- ii) All future development/expansions of the University should be carried out at the Main Campus of the University, as there is no available space in Take-off Campus.
- iii) The University Master Plan should be strictly followed when citing new projects.

## 6.6 RELEVANCE OF THE PROJECTS

## 6.6.1 Findings

All the completed projects are very relevant to the infrastructural development of the University.

#### 6.6.2 Recommendations

The Government should continue to support the University by releasing the approved statutory grants in good time to enable the institution plan ahead and utilize the funds before the end of each financial year.

## **CHAPTER SEVEN**

#### **TERM OF REFERENCE NO. 5**

To examine adequacy of the staff and staff development programs of the University

#### 7.0 INTRODUCTION

This report looks at the totality of the staff in the Federal University Dutsin-Ma: Academic, Administrative and Technical staff on which the bulk of the recurrent expenditure is spent as salaries and allowances. As it so often happens, other items such as staff development, equipment for teaching and research and other teaching materials depend on what is left of the funds. It is therefore imperative that a prudent overall staffing structure be put in place in order to ensure proper fund disbursement.

#### 7.1 OBSERVATIONS

- i) This University has academic, administrative and technical staff.
- ii) The establishment of the programmes in the University was a matter of priority.
- iii) During the period under review, there were 7 academic faculties and other service departments: the Registry, Bursary, Audit, Clinic, Physical Planning and Works and Sports Centre.
- iv) Staff development was carried out locally (within the University and in Nigerian Universities) as well as internationally.

#### 7.2 ACADEMIC STAFF

## 7.2.1 Findings

i) In all the departments, employments had been massive, both academic and non-teaching. Major areas of need have been ignored, which creates an imbalance in the nature of staffing. There is adequacy in terms of staff only in the lower ranks of Lecturer 1 and below, hence the over reliance on staff on visiting and

- on sabbatical. The nominal roll for both academic and non-teaching staff is as seen in Appendix B ... of Volume II of this Report.
- ii) Senior staff have to be searched and sourced. A good mechanism for employment drive should be put in place and employment must be rationalized.
- iii) Equipment supplied to departments are at times not what is required, in terms of specification and quantity.
- iv) From 2016 to 2020, the University had the following 7 faculties:
  - a. Faculty of Agriculture and Agricultural Technology
  - b. Faculty of Arts
  - c. Faculty of Management Sciences
  - d. Faculty of Social Sciences
  - e. Faculty of Life Sciences
  - f. Faculty of Education; and
  - g. Faculty of Physical Sciences

## Facilities and Staff Structure at 2016 -2020 TABLE 7.0 Faculty of Agriculture and Agricultural Technology

The Faculty has 7 Departments from 2016-2020. The distribution of academic staff by rank and departments is as shown in Table 7.0

S/N	Department	Profess or	Reader	Senior Lect.	Lect. I	Lect. II	Asst. Lect.	Grad. Asst.
1	Animal Science	2	2	3	5	5	12	-
2	Agric Economics	2	2	1	8	8	1	2
3	Agric Extension				5			
4	Crop Prod. and Protection	-	1	3	4	2	4	3
5	Fisheries and Aquaculture	1	-	-	6	3	5	-
6	Food Science and Tech	-	-	-	5	7	6	-

7	Forestry and Wildlife Mgt	-	-	1	2	2	9	-
8	Soil Science	-	-	1	-	1	11	3

Table 7.0 gives the figures of Academic staff by rank and departments. The whole table has shown 5 Professors, 5 Readers. The weight lies in the middle.

**TABLE 7.1:** Shows the number of Academic staff, non-teaching staff and students in the faculty from 2016-2020

. <del> </del>				
S/N	Session	Academic	Non-Teaching	Students
		Staff	Staff	
1	2016-2017	40	19	156
2.	2017-2018	46	29	549
3.	2018-2019	59	36	777
4.	2019-2020	125	108	701

What is glaring in Table 7.1 is the large number of non-teaching staff against the academic staff and students. There is over-bloated employment.

## **TABLE 7.2: Faculty of Arts**

The Faculty has 5 Departments. Table 7.2 shows the current distribution of staff by rank and departments

S/N	Department	Profess	Reader	Senior	Lect. I	Lect. II	Asst.	Grad.
		or		Lect.			Lect.	Assista
								nt
1	Arabic Studies	4	•	-	-	2	17	8
2	Hausa	1	ı	-	-	1	8	3
3	History and	7	2	3	4	6	5	1
	Strategic							
	Studies							
4	Islamic Studies	1	•	1	2	2	20	14
5	Language and	5		7	5	-	4	5
	Linguistics							

## **TABLE 7.3: Faculty of Management Sciences**

The Faculty has 2 Departments. Table 7.3 shows the distribution of staff by rank and departments

S/N	Department	Profess	Reader	Senior	Lect. I	Lect. II	Asst.	Grad.
		or		Lect.			Lect.	Assista
								nt
1	Business	6	3	5	6	8	9	17
	Management							
2	Accounting	1	1	0	5	4	7	9
	_							

## **TABLE 7.4: Faculty of Social Sciences**

The Faculty has 4 Departments. The number of academic staff by rank and department is as shown in Table 7.4

S/N	Department	Profes	Reade	Senior	Lect. I	Lect.	Asst.	Grad.
		sor	r	Lect.		II	Lect.	Assist
								ant
1.	Economics and	3	1	4	3	4	11	17
	Development							
	Studies							
2.	Geography and	3	3	3	6	3	16	11
	Regional Planning							
3.	Political Science	6	1	6	7	6	3	2
4.	Sociology	2	2	3	2	3	2	13

## **TABLE 7.5: Faculty of Life Sciences**

The Faculty has 3 Departments. Table 7.5 indicates the number of academic staff in the departments by rank

S/N	Department	Profess or	Reader	Senior Lect.	Lect. I	Lect. II	Asst. Lect.	Grad. Assista nt
1.	Biochemistry and Molecular Biology	2	2	1	6	3	7	11
2.	Biological Sciences	5	3	2	24	31	58	63
3.	Microbiology	10	2	6	14	17	21	17

**TABLE 7.6: Faculty of Life Sciences/Staff/Student Ratio** 

S/N	Session	Academic Staff	Students
1	2016 – 2017	66	916
2.	2017 – 2018	43	514
3.	2018 – 2019	56	1,200
4.	2019 – 2020	67	1,355

## **TABLE 7.7: Faculty of Education**

The Faculty has 5 Departments. Academic staff by rank and departments is as indicated in Table 7.7

S/N	Department	Profes sor	Reader	Senior Lect.	Lect. I	Lect. II	Asst. Lect.	Grad. Assista nt
1.	Educational Foundations	2	3	8	4	12	28	22
2.	Special Education	2	1	-	-	2	4	2
3.	Library And Information Science	2	-	4	4	2	8	16
4.	Science Education	1	2	-	3	4	6	
5.	Human Kinetics and Health Education	-	1	3	2	2	3	

## **TABLE 7.8: Faculty of Physical Sciences**

The Faculty has 4 Departments. The number of academic staff by rank and departments is as shown in Table 7.8

S/N	Department	Profes	Reade	Senior	Lect. I	Lect.	Asst.	Grad.
		sor	r	Lect.		II	Lect.	Asst.
1.	Applied Chemistry	23	4	9	16	23	43	30
2.	Computer Science and Information Technology	5	1	9	13	20	47	84
3.	Mathematical Sciences	12	3	4	27	20	13	29
4.	Physics	8	2	5	16	29	29	24

## **TABLE 7.9: Faculty of Physical Sciences/Staff/Student Ratio**

Table 7.9 indicates the staff/student ratio in the Faculty by academic sessions

S/N	Session	<b>Academic Staff</b>	Students
1	2016-2017	70	408
2.	2017-2018	103	794
3.	2018-2019	105	1393
4.	2019-2020	134	1771

#### 7.2.2 Recommendations

- i) The University should adhere to the NUC guidelines on staff/student ratio as stipulated in the Benchmark Minimum Academic Standards (BMAS).
- ii) The high number of non-teaching staff in all the departments shows redundancy.
- iii) Employment should be carried out in terms of needs.

## 7.3 NON-TEACHING STAFF

## 7.3.1 Findings

- i) The general trend of over bloated recruitment has also affected non-teaching staff.
- ii) Women constitute only 10% of the staff of the University.

#### 7.3.2 Recommendations

- i) The Panel recommends that Management should rationalize its employment activities of all cadres and tailor it to grow along with the development of the University and the provision of essential facilities.
- ii) There is need for caution to avoid premature over-staffing.
- iii) The Panel also recommends the employment of more women in future recruitment exercises.

## 7.4 WORKSHOPS, SEMINARS AND CONFERENCES

## 7.4.1 Findings

- TETFund is the major source of staff development through research grants, trainings, conferences and workshops
- ii) Training and other forms of capacity building are also available to non-teaching staff, subject to availability of funds.

#### 7.4.2 Recommendations

The University should continue to sponsor both academic and non-teaching staff for trainings, conferences and workshops.

## **Table 7.10: Conference Attendance - Academic**

Table 7.10 shows the number of academic staff that have attended TETFund's sponsored national and international conferences in the period under review

Year		Sponsor	National	International	Total
			Conference	Conference	
2016	to	TETFUND	17	39	56
2020		Sponsorsh	nip		

## **Table 7.11: Conference Attendance - Non-Teaching**

The number of non-teaching staff who have benefitted from TETFund's sponsored national and international conferences in the period under review is as shown in Table 7.11

Year	Sponsor	National Conference	International Conference	Total
2016 to 2020	TETFUND Sponsorship	122	6	128

## 7.5 STAFF DEVELOPMENT

## 7.5.1 Findings

- i) An examination of the staff rank disposition shows a very serious imbalance between Senior and Junior Academic staff composition. There are more of Lecturers 1 and below.
- ii) The over reliance on visiting lecturers and sabbatical staff may affect the performance and growth of the University.

## 7.5.2 Recommendations

- i) There is need to develop a well-planned and sustained staff development programme, which would ensure sustenance of Academic staff and contribute to the economic and social improvement of the community.
- ii) The Panel recommends that equal and fair treatment should be accorded to all staff members with regards to promotion and self-development.
- iii) Linkages and collaborations should be strengthened.

## **CHAPTER EIGHT**

#### **TERM OF REFERENCE NO. 6**

To determine the relationship between the University and the various statutory bodies it interacts with according to its law, for the purposes of supervision, planning, finance, discipline, guidance and any other relationship (i.e. Governing Council, National Universities Commission, Federal Ministry of Education)

#### 8.0 INTRODUCTION

The Federal University, Dutsin-Ma, just like any other public University in Nigeria cannot function effectively without relating to some statutory bodies according to its law and statutes for purposes of supervision, planning, discipline, finance, among others. In addressing this TOR, the Panel relied on oral submissions and relevant documents in assessing the relationship between the FUDMA and the key MDAs (Ministries, Departments and Agencies) as well as the host community.

#### 8.1 OBSERVATIONS

- i) The Visitor relates with the University through the Federal Ministry of Education.
- ii) The Federal Ministry of Education relates directly with the University through NUC and Council.
- iii) The University relates with JAMB for the purpose of admission.
- iv) It relates with NUC for general guidelines.
- v) It relates with TETFund in relation to funding, projects and programmes.

#### 8.2 THE VISITOR

## 8.2.1 Findings

- i) The Visitor established the Federal University, Dutsin-Ma in 2011, backed by the Federal University of Dutsin-Ma (Establishment) Act, 2015.
- ii) The Visitor appointed Prof. James Ayatse as the pioneer Vice Chancellor in 2011.
- iii) He also constituted the first Council (headed by H.E Erelu Olusola Obada) in 2015.

- iv) FUDMA was not subjected to any visitation exercise since its inception.
- v) The first Council was inaugurated four years after the establishment of the University and dissolved less than one (1) year after its inauguration.
- vi) The non-existence of Council for a long period was probably responsible for the various petitions written against the University. Moreover, not having a Council in place means that many vital policies and decisions were kept in abeyance.

#### 8.2.2 Recommendations

- i) Governing Councils should be constituted or re-constituted as and when due, as provided for by law.
- ii) To bring stability to the University, the Visitor should allow the Council to run its tenure unhindered. Dissolution of Councils or any Council should be based on just cause not on the basis of change in government and/or the Visitor.

#### 8.3 FEDERAL MINISTRY OF EDUCATION

# 8.3.1 Findings

- i) The Federal Ministry of Education (FME) took statutory responsibilities to the University in the period under review.
- ii) It also acted in the absence of Council.
- iii) However, the decision of the Honourable Minister of Education to direct the Council to do the right thing in the case of the arbitrary extension of the tenure of appointment of Prof. Armaya'u Hamisu Bichi as acting Vice-Chancellor of FUDMA was rather too late.

#### 8.3.2 Recommendations

- i) The Federal Ministry of Education should continue to keep a closer watch on the activities of universities and ensure that the universities are administered according to the extant law, statutes, rules and regulations.
- ii) Appropriate mechanisms should be put in place to sanction any of its officials or appointees who embark on any action that violates the extant law, rules, statutes or circulars.

#### 8.4 NATIONAL UNIVERSITIES COMMISSION

# 8.4.1 Findings

- i) The relationship between the University Management and the National Universities Commission (NUC) during the period under review was generally cordial as the NUC performed its statutory regulatory functions in the University.
- ii) As part of its regulatory functions, the NUC carried out resource verification for proposed programmes and conducted accreditation exercises for old programmes. During the period under review, no programme in the University was denied accreditation.
- iii) The NUC also serves as a clearing house between the University and the Federal Ministry of Education.

#### 8.4.2 Recommendations

The National Universities Commission (NUC) should continue to play its regulatory and advisory role in the management of the University.

#### 8.5 COUNCIL

### 8.5.1 Findings

- i) Council was established by the Federal University of Dutsin-Ma (Establishment)
   Act, 2015.
- ii) Council is made of external and internal members of University community.

#### 8.5.2 Recommendations

- i) Council should be encouraged to work in accordance with the law and in the best interest of the University.
- ii) Appointment of members should be in accordance with section 6(2) of the Act in order to have "persons of proven integrity, knowledgeable and familiar with the affairs and tradition of the University"

#### 8.6 TERTIARY EDUCATION TRUST FUND

### 8.6.1 Findings

- Tertiary Education Trust Fund (TETFund) was created by law to intervene in the funding of the Universities' projects and programmes.
- ii) The University maintained a good relationship with the TETFund during the period under review as evident in the various projects of the two campuses of the University. However, some of the petitions written against the University had to do with embezzlement, misapplication, and misappropriation of funds, among other infractions.

#### 8.6.2 Recommendations

- i) The Project Monitoring Committee should always ensure that all projects are executed to specification(s).
- ii) The Physical Planning, and Works Department should inspect and supervise all projects regularly.
- iii) Management should always follow due process including adherence to provisions of the Public Procurement Act (PPA) 2007 in the award of contracts.
- iv) TETFund should continue to play its statutory role in funding Projects, Research and Development.

### 8.7 JOINT ADMISSIONS AND MATRICULATION BOARD

# 8.7.1 Findings

- i) Students' enrolment in the University increased steadily during the period under review, with many candidates seeking admission through the Unified Tertiary Matriculation Examination (UTME) and Direct Entry, which is conducted by the Joint Admissions and Matriculation Board (JAMB).
- ii) The Information and Communication Technology (ICT) Computer-Based Test (CBT) Centre of the University was approved by JAMB for purposes of registration of candidates for the UTME and for the conduct of CBT.

iii) Sadly, the Visitation Panel observed that some of the computers and other facilities at the ICT-CBT Centre were not working while the computers in the second wing of the Centre were yet to be installed.

### 8.7.2 Recommendations

- i) University Management should ensure that all the computers and other facilities at the ICT-CBT Centre are functional.
- ii) Technical staff of the ICT and CBT Centre should be encouraged and supported to undergo training and re-training periodically.

### **CHAPTER NINE**

## **TERM OF REFERENCE NO. 7**

Examine the law establishing the University, including the relationship between the various internal organs, units and offices and indicate the ways the law has been observed by the competent authorities and also suggest any modifications to the law.

### 9.0 INTRODUCTION

Federal University of Dutsin-Ma (Establishment) Act, 2015 was the instrument that established Federal University Dutsin-Ma, for the purpose of ensuring equity and access to tertiary education in the country. The Bill which gave birth to the Act was passed by the Senate on 23<sup>rd</sup> April, 2013, and was passed by the House of Representatives on 3<sup>rd</sup> March, 2015. It was subsequently signed into law on the 26<sup>th</sup> of March, 2015 and finally gazetted in April, 2016. The Act sufficiently provides for certain internal organs, units and offices.

#### 9.1 OBSERVATIONS

- i) The law establishing the University is the Federal University of Dutsin-Ma (Establishment) Act, 2015.
- ii) The law provides for Chancellor, Council, Senate, Congregation and Convocation.
- iii) The law also provides for the Vice Chancellor, Deputy Vice Chancellor, Registrar, Bursar, University Librarian who are collectively referred to as the University management.

#### 9.2 COUNCIL

# 9.2.1 Findings

- i) During the period under review, there were 3 Councils: 2015-2016; 2016-2020; and 2020 to date.
- ii) The Council was appointed in accordance with the provisions of the law.

#### 9.2.1 Recommendations

Council should continue to conduct its affairs in line with provisions of the law.

### 9.3 SENATE

# 9.3.1 Findings

- The Law of the Federal University, Dutsin-Ma gives Senate the responsibility of organising and controlling teaching at the University, admission and discipline of students and the promotion of research.
- ii) The Senate has power to establish new campus, college, faculty, department, school, institute or other teaching and research units of the University, or any Hall of residence or similar institution at the University with the approval of Council.

# 9.2.2 Recommendations

- i) Senate should continue to strengthen the admission processes in accordance with the relevant rules and regulations.
- ii) Senate should continue to strengthen the processes of teaching and research.
- iii) Senate should create and develop centres of excellence.

#### 9.3 VICE CHANCELLOR

# 9.3.1 Findings

- i) The Vice-Chancellor under the Federal University of Dutsin-Ma (Establishment) Act, 2015 is the Administrative and Academic Head of the University.
- ii) The Vice Chancellor is the Head of the University management comprised of the Deputy Vice Chancellors, the Registrar, the Bursar and the University Librarian.
- iii) The Vice Chancellor is the Chairman of Senate.
- iv) The Vice Chancellor is a member of Council.
- v) The appointment of the 2<sup>nd</sup> substantive Vice Chancellor contravenes section 3 of the Miscellaneous Amendment Act of 1993.

### 9.3.2 Recommendations

- i) The Vice Chancellor should be encouraged to be inclusive in the administration of the University.
- ii) The Vice Chancellor should be encouraged to develop his strategic plan within the vision and mission of the University.
- iii) In the appointment of a Vice Chancellor, Council should act in accordance with the provisions of the law.

### **CHAPTER TEN**

### **TERM OF REFERENCE NO. 8**

To trace the historical evolution of the university and take stock of its net achievements and problems as well as its style and direction.

#### 10.0 INTRODUCTION

The Federal University, Dutsin-Ma (FUDMA) was one of the 12 Federal Universities approved by the Federal Executive Council of the Federal Republic of Nigeria at its 44<sup>th</sup> meeting of 22<sup>nd</sup> December 2010. The establishment of the institutions was for ensuring equity in the distribution of federally-owned universities and improving access to quality university education in the country. The appointment of the Vice-Chancellor of the University, Professor James O.I. Ayatse (former Vice Chancellor of Federal University of Agriculture, Makurdi), and the Registrar, Muhammad Y. Abubakar (former Deputy Registrar at Umaru Musa Yar'Adua University, Katsina), which was announced on 9th February 2011 by the Honourable Minister of Education, Professor Rugayyatu Ahmed Rufa'i, OON, took effect on 16th February 2011. The University was established as a conventional or general university that was expected to evolve and emerge as a centre of excellence in its chosen areas of strength or comparative advantage. The Vice-Chancellor and Registrar officially assumed duties on 10th March 2011, the day they were formally presented to the Government of Katsina State by the Honourable Minister of Education.

#### 10.1 OBSERVATIONS

i) The Federal University Dutsin-Ma commenced its academic activities from a takeoff campus graciously donated by the Katsina State Government with Title Document which was the site of the former Government Day Secondary School Dutsin-Ma, renovated and remodeled to accommodate the Central Administrative Building, Classrooms for Lectures, Staff Offices, University Clinic, the ICT building, the University Library, the Vice-Chancellor's Lodge, the Registrar's Lodge as well as the Sports and Recreational Centers.

- ii) The Take-off Site of the University measures about 18 hectares, while the Main Campus measures about 1,200 hectares, approximately 20 kilometers from the Take-off Site.
- iii) The University took off for its first academic year on 14<sup>th</sup> July 2012 and commenced lectures on 23<sup>rd</sup> July 2012. It held its first Matriculation on 30<sup>th</sup> July 2012, with a student population of 460. The University was the first to call students to campus, commence lectures and matriculate its students out of the nine new federal universities.
- iv) In the period under review, the Federal University, Dutsin-Ma commenced academic activities in the 2011/2012 academic session and graduated its first set of students in 2015.
- v) The University had made significant progress in the development of Phase 1 of its Academic Development Plan as provided in Federal University Dutsin-Ma Academic Brief 2011/12-2020/21.

#### 10.2 PHASES OF ACADEMIC DEVELOPMENT

The phases of academic development of the University as stated in the Academic Brief are as summarized in Table 10.0:

**Table 10.0** 

Phase	Duration	Session
Phase 1	5 years	2011/12-2015/16
Phase 2	5 years	2016/17-2020/17
Phase 3	5 years	2021/22-2025/26
Phase 4	5 years	2026/27-2030/31

The University operated without a Council until 2015 when it was constituted. In May 2015, Council approved the creation of new Faculties and additional Departments and programmes. The details of the approved structure, with effect from 2015/2016 is as provided in Table 10.1:

**Table 10.1: Approved Academic Structure** 

FACULTY	DEPARTMENT	PROGRAMME
Management	Business Management	B.Sc. Business Management
Sciences	Accounting	B.Sc. Accounting
		B.Sc. Finance
Social	Political Science	B.Sc. Political Science
Sciences	Geography and Regional	B.Sc. Geography and Regional
	Planning	Planning
	Economics and Development	B.Sc. Economics
	Studies	
	Sociology	B.Sc. Sociology
	History and Diplomatic Studies	B.A. History and Strategic Studies
Arts	Religious Studies	B.A. Islamic Studies
		B.A. Christian Studies
	Languages and Linguistics	B.A. English
		B.A. Linguistics
	Biochemistry and Molecular	B.Sc. Biochemistry
	Biology	
Science	Basic and Applied Chemistry	B.Sc. Industrial Chemistry
	Physics	B.Sc. Physics Electronics
	Geology	B.Sc. Geology
	Biological Sciences	B.Sc. Biology
		B.Sc. Microbiology
	Mathematical Sciences and	B.Sc. Mathematics
	Information Technology	B.Sc. Computer Sci. and IT

		B.Sc. Ed. (Chemistry)
		B.Sc. Ed. (Physics)
Education	Science Education	B.Sc. Ed. (Biology)
		BSc. Ed (Human Kinetics and
		Health Edu)
		B.Sc. Ed. (Maths)
	Education Foundations	BA. Ed (English)
	Fisheries and Aquaculture	B. Fisheries and Aquaculture
	Technology	Tech.
Agriculture	Forestry Resources and	B. Forestry Resources Mgt.
	Environmental Management	
	Animal Health and Production	B. Agric. Animal Production and
		Health
	Crop Production and Protection	B. Agric. Crop Production and
		Protection
	Agricultural Economics,	B. Agric. Agric. Economics
	Extension and Rural Sociology	
	Food Science and Technology	B. Food Science and Technology
	Home Management Science	B. Home Management

### 10.3 ACADEMIC DEVELOPMENT DOCUMENTS

The University has an Academic Brief and a Master Plan for the development of the Take-off Campus and the Main Campus. The parcels of land for the campuses were provided by the Katsina State Government. The University has title documents for both campuses.

### 10.4 RELATIONSHIP WITH THE HOST COMMUNITY

The University has a cordial relationship with the host community in the period under review and has received huge support from the community. The University

donated computers to the Community Secondary School, Dutsin-Ma and the Government Day Secondary School, Darawa. The Community also has access to and uses the University Clinic.

#### 10.5 DIRECTORATES AND OTHER UNITS

In addition to the Library, Bursary and Registry, the University also has the following directorates, departments and units under the Office of the Vice Chancellor:

- i) Academic Planning
- ii) Directorate of Research Development
- iii) Directorate of Advancement and Linkages
- iv) Physical Planning and Works
- v) Information and Communication Technology
- vi) Internal Audit
- vii) Students Affairs
- viii) Sports
- ix) Security
- x) University SIWES
- xi) School of General and Preliminary Studies
- xii) SERVICOM
- xiii) Transport

#### 10.6 ACHIEVEMENTS OF THE UNIVERSITY

Basically, Federal University, Dutsin-Ma under the leadership of its second substantive Vice-Chancellor, Professor Haruna Abdu Kaita who served from 2016 to 2017 as well as other acting Vice-Chancellors, Professor Armaya'u Hamisu Bichi (2017 to 2019), Professor Baba N. Chama Kutigi (April 2019 to October, 2019), Dr. Babangida Umar Dangani (October 2019 to May 2020) up to the third substantive Vice-Chancellor, Professor Armaya'u Hamisu Bichi (2020 till date) had witnessed numerous achievements as follows:

#### 10.6.1 Staff Welfare

The Panel notes that the University Management between the year 2016 and 2020 had always realized that a properly motivated workforce was required to achieve its vision as to actualize the overall strategic development of the University. By so doing, the University gave attention to regular promotion of staff at all levels of operation.

## 10.6.2 Students' Welfare

In ensuring that students' are well catered for, two halls of residence were provided for students with the assistance of the Katsina State Government. The Male Hostel was a remodelled primary school in Hayin-Gada, while the Female Hostel is located in the premises of Isa Kaita College of Education, Dutsin-Ma, as well as the former residences of the Vice Chancellor and the Registrar.

#### 10.6.3 Provisions of Shuttle Buses

During the period under review, the University Management acquired shuttle buses for conveying students from Take-off campus to Main campus for their lectures.

# **10.6.4** Establishment of Computer Based Test (CBT) Centre on Campus

The University established a CBT Centre on campus, which was used for First semester examinations of 2018/2019 academic session. The Centre has capacity to accommodate six hundred candidates at a sitting.

# **10.6.5** Staff Training

In this connection, due mention should be made of staff training (in-house), for the senior staff of the Registry Unit of the University. However, the management had at one time or another organized an in-house training of senior staff of the Registry Unit so as to be able to update their knowledge

with new techniques, to enable them perform well in the discharge of their respective functions. Similarly, during the period under review, it was observed that appreciable number of teaching and non-teaching staff were able to attend local conferences, while forty-five (45) non-teaching and twenty-three (23) teaching staff secured Academic Staff Training and Development (ASTD) sponsorship locally.

## 10.7 NOTABLE CHALLENGES FACED BY THE UNIVERSITY

Despite numerous achievements recorded by the University, between 2016 to 2020 under the leadership of the various Vice-Chancellors of Federal University, Dutsin-Ma, the University was also faced with numerous challenges.

# **10.7.1** Lack of Housing for Staff

The Panel notes that housing for staff has been a major challenge for the University. There is no provision for accommodation of staff. Majority of them live in hired houses in Katsina and are subjected to daily travel to and fro the University which is located about 65km from Katsina.

The Panel notes that staff discipline had remained an intractable problem amongst the staff of the University. The level of indiscipline amongst the staff had severally affected their attitude to work, which has led to insubordination, absenteeism, leakage of examination question papers as well as disrespect to constituted authority.

# **10.7.2** Security/Theft Cases

The security situation at the Main Campus of the University is alarming to the extent that staff and students are living in fear. The activities of the bandits and kidnappers have worsened the situation. More importantly, the Panel noted that on 14<sup>th</sup> of August, 2019, a number of cattle, sheep and goats

belonging to the University were rustled by the bandits. Efforts made by the University to recover them proved abortive.

# 10.7.3 Inadequate Shuttle Buses

The Panel notes that the available buses for conveying students to and from the Main Campus are not adequate for the large number of students. The Panel also notes that most of the buses are not in good shape, probably due to constant use and overcrowding.

# 10.7.4 Inadequate Hostel Accommodation for Students

The University is confronted with inadequate hostel accommodation for both male and female students as the population of the students keeps increasing. Although there are 2 furnished hostels in the main campus for male and female students, they have remained un-operational due to insecurity. Thus, the hostels have continued to deteriorate with all the facilities therein. Consequently, majority of the students have to contend with living off-campus with the attendant high cost of rent, unbefitting privately-owned hostels or houses, as well as insecurity. However, some male students are being housed at a place provided by the State Government at Hayin-Gada. The State Government also offered a place at the Isa Kaita College of Education, Dutsin-Ma for female students of the University. The residences of the Vice Chancellor and Registrar at the Take-off Campus were also converted into female hostels, but these available accommodation facilities are grossly inadequate.

# **10.7.5** Lack of Electricity Supply

The Main Campus of the University is yet to be connected to the National Grid. Consequently, the University has been operating on generators since November, 2018; with all the attendant fuel and maintenance costs.

## **10.7.6** Inadequate Funding

Inadequate funding of the University has posed a great constraint to the University's activities including infrastructural development and other operations. Monthly overhead cost before Covid-19 was just N3.5m and N3m was used for payment of security personnel engaged to secure the main campus. However, it was recently increased to about N8m, but that notwithstanding, the balance of N5m after payment of security bills is barely enough for the day-to-day running of the University.

# 10.7.7 Litigation

The University is currently saddled with a number of litigations that have distracted and slowed down its developmental endeavours. Prominent among these cases are the ones instituted by the former Vice Chancellor, Prof. Haruna Abdu Kaita, challenging his suspension and subsequent removal at the National Industrial Courts in Kano and Abuja. Some other cases were instituted by former staff of the University who were sacked by the former Vice Chancellor, Prof. Haruna A. Kaita. The Panel noted that during the period under review (2016 - 2020), the University was confronted with thirty-four (34) cases at different courts. Some of these cases are either pending in court, settled out of court or have been determined.

# 10.7.8 Lack of Qualified Academic Staff at the Senior Level

The Panel notes that lack of qualified academic staff at the senior cadre has been a great challenge to the University. There has been difficulty in attracting quality staff to the University due to lack of accommodation, insecurity as well as the location of the University. Senior staff in other universities have refused to come to the University or to accept offer of teaching or non-teaching appointments. This has led to the recruitment of more academic staff at the junior cadre, making the academic structure bottom-heavy (see **Appendix B8**).

# 10.7.9 Inadequate Laboratories and Equipment

Functional laboratories are vital for most Departments that deploy laboratories for effective teaching and research. However, the Panel noted that available laboratories in the University are inadequate in number and space with insufficient routine consumables. Most times students are shared into groups during laboratory sessions. This causes delay or increase in time required for practical. The over-crowded laboratory sessions increase high risks of accidents and exposure to illnesses for the students.

#### 10.8 RECOMMENDATIONS

In view of the challenges outlined above, the Panel recommends that the Federal Government, through its agencies (Federal Ministry of Education, TETFUND as well as National Universities Commission), should consider, as a matter of urgency, the need to provide adequate funds in order to address the above challenges as these will enhance academic growth and development of the University.

# **CHAPTER ELEVEN**

#### **TERM OF REFERENCE NO. 9**

To examine the general security in the University and how the University has dealt with it and recommend appropriate measures.

#### 11.0 INTRODUCTION

Established in 2011, the Federal University, Dutsin-Ma is located in Dutsin-Ma, which is about 60km away from Katsina. With the Take-off Campus, the Main Campus is about 20km apart. Students and staff commute between the two campuses for official transactions.

Acting proactively, the University Management had created the Directorate of Security Services with the mandate to manage and contain security challenges. While the early years of the University witnessed few and scattered security incidences, there has emerged a new dimension of security challenge that is pervasive and national in outlook. Consequently, there is the need for huge logistic outlay with equally huge financial commitment.

During the period under review, the Directorate has established a working relationship with other relevant agencies for effective performance of its duties.

#### 11.1 OBSERVATIONS

- i) At the inception of the Federal University, Dutsin-Ma in 2011, it commenced activities at the Take-Off Campus. With time, the development of the Main campus 20km from the Take-Off Campus, activities commenced in 2018. The dual campus reality has created new challenges for the University generally and for security specifically.
- ii) With growing students' population of over 5,000 with all its diversity and a staff population of over 2,500, the security situation calls for careful and meticulous

- handling of diverse population. This diverse population must be carefully managed in relation to the host community, regard being had to the intrusion of popular culture, cultural diversities and intergroup relationships.
- iii) The general national security matrix has added a new dimension to the University security regime. Reports of banditry, kidnapping and general insecurity have continued to generate fear and concerns among the populace, including the University community. This has also introduced other national security agencies whose operations have brought further logistics and financial burdens to the University.
- iv) The internal and external dimensions of the security challenges have been successfully contained. The University Management has swiftly acted to contain cult activities, while proactively engaging other national security agencies in coordinated efforts to contain any eventual security breaches.
- v) The Directorate of Security Service of the University coordinates the security regimes under the general supervision of the Vice Chancellor. With a staff strength of 223, it lacks operational vehicles, gadgets and other equipment for effective security performance.

# 11.2 Findings

- i) The University Management has established collaboration and cooperation between the Military, Police, Department of State Security Services, Nigerian Civil Defence Corps and other relevant agencies.
- ii) There are incidences of banditry, kidnapping and other security breaches on a state-wide ramification.
- iii) There are emerging incidences of cult activities among the students of the University.
- iv) The Directorate of Security Services of the University has challenges of lack of training, insufficient operational facilities and rationalisation of the cadres in the service.

- v) The development of the Main Campus has created its own security challenges; situated twenty-one kilometres away from the town with no settlements sufficient to contain security challenges in that area. Moving students between the two campuses also creates concerns in the minds of students and parents. The host community is equally concerned with this security challenge.
- vi) There is a corresponding increase in extra budgetary expenditure in view of the nature and exigencies of containing security challenges.

#### 11.3 Recommendations

- The Federal Government should, from time to time, make special financial allocation to the University to cope with vagaries of the present security challenges.
- ii) The Federal Government should seriously consider the development of a University town around the Main Campus with all facilities complemented with security complex.
- iii) The Federal Government should encourage the Government of Katsina State to continue to support the University Management in containing the security challenges.
- iv) The University Management should be directed to provide operational vehicles, motorcycles, and modern communication gadgets for effective containment of any security situation.
- v) The University Management should be directed to strengthen the Intelligence Unit of the Directorate. Equally, all personnel with NCE/Diploma should be regraded to Assistant Patrol/Security Supervisors due to their educational qualifications.

### **CHAPTER TWELVE**

#### **TERM OF REFERENCE NO. 10**

To examine the processes and structures of discipline of students in the University in line with due process of the rule of law.

#### 12.0 INTRODUCTION

The requirement under this Term of Reference directed the Visitation Panel to examine the processes and structures of discipline of students in the University in line with due process of the rule of law. To do this effectively, the Panel sought to find if there was in existence in the University the legal basis establishing the framework for students' discipline. It also sought to determine whether the University had enacted regulations and codes guiding students' conduct and proscribing misconduct.

The Panel similarly set out to determine the existence of committees, the availability of cases brought before the committee, the role of the University Security and the Investigation Committees at different levels and the rights afforded the students alleged as having committed misconduct to see how far the processes and procedures are either consistent or at variance with the dictates of the rule of law.

### 12.1 OBSERVATIONS

- i) That the University adopted as Regulation in 2018 two documents:
  - a) The Federal University, Dutsin-Ma Code of Conduct for Students'
     Discipline; and
  - b) The Federal University, Dutsin-Ma students' General Code of Ethics.
- ii) The law provides for disciplinary actions on students' General Code of Ethics.

- iii) The Panel was not availed with records of proceedings in respect of students' misconduct, despite repeated demands. Therefore, there was no evidence to establish whether or not there was adherence to due process.
- iv) The Panel notes that Section 19 of the Act grants the Vice Chancellor discretionary powers to determine misconduct which powers may run against the rule of law.

# 12.2 Findings

- The Panel finds that there is a process in place for the investigation of students' involvement in misconduct cases in a number of cases during this period under review.
- ii) The Directorate of Security Services is actively involved in investigations and submits its report to the Vice Chancellor.
- iii) The Vice Chancellor transmits the report to the Students' Disciplinary Committee (SDC).
- iv) After listening to the students involved, the SDC reviews the facts and investigation reports and makes its findings and decisions known to Senate.
- v) The Senate finally decides on the appropriate ruling to make in each case.
- vi) In relation to the rule of law, the Panel finds that there are enough documents to show that cases alleging misconduct and indiscipline were adequately addressed.

#### 12.3 Recommendations

- i) The University should, as a matter of urgency, review both the regulations on students' ethics and misconduct and the code of conduct for students with a view to meeting the standard of due process and the rule of law.
- ii) The University should ensure that the regulations and the codes are expressed in simple, clear and plain language.
- iii) The University should ensure that these regulations and codes are published extensively and uploaded on the University portal.

- iv) It is recommended that the University should continue with the trend of strictly complying with the guidelines governing misconduct and indiscipline.
- v) The University should introduce an administrative appeal or review mechanism to allow students first submit their appeal to this body before approaching the court.

### CHAPTER THIRTEEN

#### **GENERAL COMMENTS**

- i) There have been general observations from the staff about the Integrated Payroll and Personnel Payment Information System (IPPIS). It is a general view that the system is causing unnecessary hardships.
- ii) The Senate building at the Main campus is of poor quality in terms of workmanship, finishing, fittings and fixtures. The furnishing of the Senate chamber is equally of poor quality.
- iii) The University should avoid engaging casual staff and those currently engaged should be regularised.
- iv) The processes for staff promotion should be fair, transparent, objective and reasonable, and in accordance with the law.
- v) The setting and marking of examinations for all courses should be restricted to academic staff.
- vi) Members of Visitation Panels should be of diverse competences to effectively cover the field and Terms of Reference.

Page 60